

## Closing the Loop End of Year Report

### 1. Task Force Members

Jennifer Beard  
Amy Lahmers

Former Director  
Program Director

The Women's Place  
College of Medicine; Past PPCW Chair

### 2. Charge

2.1 During the 2012-2013 work years the PPCW instituted a standing task force entitled, "Closing the Loop" which is charged with the ongoing task of documenting and monitoring the recommendations of the PPCW's various task forces and initiatives. The activities of "Closing the Loop" task force are specified in the PPCW Operating Guidelines and each year will be chaired by the immediate past chair of the PPCW in partnership with the Director of The Women's Place. The task force continues to build a scorecard spreadsheet to track the movement of PPCW recommendations. This report reflects PPCW activities that took place between 2014 and 2019—the time period for the current President's tenure at OSU.

### 3. Process/Activities (see below)

Concern/Issue	Recommendations/Steps Taken	Timeframe	Senior Leader Partners
Male Dominant Culture	<p><b>Help leaders recognize women as leaders.</b> The majority of 2019 participants (4 of 6) selected for the Big Ten Academic Alliance (formerly CIC) Leadership program are women.</p> <p><b>Hire more women leaders.</b> With the addition of J. Nwando Olayiwola, MD, as chair of Family Medicine; Amy Moore, MD, as chair of Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery; Sayoko (Sy) Moroi, MD, as chair of Ophthalmology and Visual Science; and Isabelle Deschenes, PhD, as chair of Physiology and Cell Biology, by January 2020, 26% of the College of Medicine's department chairs are women — 11% above the national average. Melissa Shivers was named the next vice president for student life. Gretchen Ritter was named the next dean of the College of Arts and Sciences. Katherine Lasher was named associate vice president for the Office of Institutional Equity, a new, centralized unit responsible for the university's compliance with Title IX, the Americans with Disabilities Act and other federal and state laws and university policies. Amy Fairchild, PhD, MPH was named Dean of the College of Public Health. Stephanie Sanders was named associate vice president of Strategic Enrollment Planning in the Office of Student Academic Success.</p>	<p><b>2017-2019</b></p> <p><b>2019-Ongoing</b></p>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b></p> <p>Susan Basso, OHR K. Craig Kent, Medicine Bruce McPheron, OAA Alison Mincey, OHR James Moore, ODI Kay Wolf, OAA</p>

	<p><b>Provide learning opportunities for administration, faculty, staff and students on gender equity.</b> The Women's Place and partners, with the support of Provost McPheron has implemented the Advocate and Allies program, which focuses on transforming the climate of the institution by enhancing men's engagement in equity work. Approximately 419 men from various units have participated in Allies workshops that were conducted by Advocates. The College Arts &amp; Sciences is expanding the Advocates and Allies initiative in an effort to reinforce their progress around inclusive excellence.</p> <p><b>Provide inclusive excellence training.</b> The practice of providing inclusive hiring trainings for faculty search committees at the start of each search is the predominant practice in place today. There are several models for delivering the trainings. Some colleges provide one or two workshop sessions on an annual basis, others conduct a facilitated workshop for individual searches, and some colleges use a combination of online training materials plus a facilitated discussion. While the larger colleges implement workshops that are tailored to their disciplines and internal practices, the Office of Diversity and Inclusion continues to consult with colleagues to update and refine practices and ODI staff collaborate with other units that have limited capacity to deliver trainings. ODI staff, along with Quinn Capers, MD, continue to host workshops executive-level searches in partnership with the Office of Human Resources.</p> <p><b>Require online applications for all faculty hires.</b> This will allow better analysis of hiring practices by unit and will assist in Affirmative Action goals and planning. This will occur once Workday is implemented. All faculty, staff and students will complete an online job application. The Workday application will enable us to collect their basic demographic information as well as work experience. It will allow for multiple attachments and an opportunity for the faculty to attach a link to their personal website or work. The letters of reference can be collected immediately after the application is submitted or after the pool of candidates is whittled down depending on the department's preference.</p>	<p><b>2015- Ongoing</b></p> <p><b>2015</b></p> <p><b>Unmet (projected completion with Workday in 2021)</b></p>	
Lack of Understanding of Gender Bias	<p><b>Transform workplace culture.</b> Identify and address implicit bias through the Office of Human Resources via the offering of a 2-hour in-person workshop that is open to all employees. Approximately 200 leaders, including the Wexner Medical Center Senior Leadership Team, members of the College of Medicine Dean's College Council (Chairs, Center Directors, Faculty Council Representatives, and Administrative Staff) and members of the Medical Directors Collaborative, including WMC physician leaders recently participated in Implicit Bias training, through an initiative organized by the College of Medicine's Faculty Experience Committee.</p> <p><b>Buckeye Portal on Inclusive Excellence is expected to launch in Spring 2020.</b> The Buckeye Portal for Inclusive Excellence is a central repository of Ohio State activities, events and programs that support the university's efforts toward Inclusive Excellence. It serves as an entry point for unit action planning and</p>	<p><b>2018- Ongoing</b></p> <p><b>2020</b></p>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b> Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR James Moore, ODI Kay Wolf, OAA</p>

	cataloging of these efforts. It will provide opportunities for collaboration as well as serve as a foundation for identifying promising practices in inclusive excellence.		
Salary Inequities	<p><b>Incentivize colleges to address inequities in salary when males earn more than females in similar positions.</b> Diversity Impact Analysis is now a component of each dean's review. Dean's compensation correlates with diversity and inclusion outcomes during annual reviews. A faculty compensation review is planned for 2020</p> <p><b>Address salary inequities via Career Road Map (fka Compensation and Class).</b> The Office of Human Resources is currently reviewing and addressing salary inequities. Academic advisors have been reviewed and adjusted. Other titles are now under review. HR will continue to build out Affirmative Action goals and planning to ensure ongoing compliance and best practices in approach.</p> <p><b>Dismantle barriers.</b> The Kirwan Institute and the Office of Human Resources at The Ohio State University has joined the Columbus Women's Commission to help dismantle barriers and reduce gender-based inequities to improve the economic position of women in Columbus. The Kirwan Institute published our <a href="#">Workforce for the Modern Woman</a> to highlight gendered and racial pay gaps and help organizations identify concrete solutions to close these gaps. Kirwan partnered with a cohort of local champions of gender equity to share the results and encourage sustained dialogue. Partners included the Columbus Women's Commission, the Women's Fund of Central Ohio, the Women's Place, and The Association for Staff and Faculty Women at Ohio State.</p> <p><b>Develop Buckeye Portal on Salaries.</b> Comparison of employees by gender, rank, position and unit by salary are possible. HR will continue to build out Affirmative Action goals and plan to ensure ongoing compliance and best practices in approach. The TWP will work with Colleges and units on individualized planning around compensation, as necessary, from a compliance perspective.</p>	<p><b>2018-Ongoing</b></p> <p><b>Ongoing</b></p> <p><b>2017-2020</b></p> <p><b>2018-2020</b></p>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b>  Susan Basso, OHR  Alison Mincey, OHR  James Moore, ODI  Kay Wolf, OAA</p>
Glass Breakers/Awards	<p><b>Institutionalize Glass Breakers.</b> Needs a permanent institutional home. The Office of Human Resources declined adding Glass Breakers to the awards they oversee. The Association of Staff &amp; Faculty Women in collaboration with The Women's Place, has agreed to continue the Award.</p> <p><b>Equity in Awards.</b> Pay careful attention to the composition of nominating and selection committees to ensure equitable consideration based on gender and ethnicity. Create more opportunities for early and mid-level career awards for staff. Distribute Academic Analytics data to Deans and department chairs annually, with a request to review the data and return to the provost with a one-page memo summarizing the status of women in their College or department and a preliminary plan to address any challenges identified in the data.</p>	<b>Continuous</b>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b>  Susan Basso, OHR  Bruce McPheron, OAA  Alison Mincey, OHR  James Moore, ODI  Kay Wolf, OAA</p>

Faculty	<p><b>Exit (separation) interviews.</b> Standardize faculty exit interviews to identify themes related to separations.</p> <p><b>Examine faculty separations and retention.</b> A Carole Anderson faculty fellow joined OAA to examine faculty turnover among “separated” faculty. She interviewed 32 faculty who resigned from the University.</p> <p><b>Conduct Ohio State Culture surveys.</b> The administration of revised culture surveys for faculty and Wexner Medical Center staff began in Spring 2017, but non-Wexner Medical Center staff have not received it. As part of the Ohio State Talent and Culture survey we will be looking at best in class organizations and how they measure employee engagement. The goal of OHR would be to have one employee engagement survey for all employees at Ohio State but will not begin to explore this until Workday is implemented. In the meantime, the Wexner Medical Center still has their Press Ganey Employee Engagement survey and Ohio State launched a values and ethics survey which will provide information on values and ethics and in addition we will gain a secondary benefit to learn about our culture as it relates to how we behave from a values perspective.</p> <p>The College of Medicine Faculty Experience Committee implemented a <b>Lactation Initiative</b> to provide support for breastfeeding physicians:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Upon returning from maternity leave, physicians electing to breastfeed may block 30 minutes during each half-day clinic for pumping. Physicians in a full-day clinic may block 30 minutes in both the morning and afternoon clinics.</li> <li>• Productivity requirements will be reduced by 12.5 percent of the derived wRVU target during the period, which may last up to one year post-delivery date, to reflect the reduction in scheduling capacity.</li> <li>• If the physician ends breastfeeding before the end of the year, she will return to the regular template and productivity requirement.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Unmet</b></p> <p><b>2018-Ongoing</b></p>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b> Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR James Moore, ODI Kay Wolf, OAA</p>
Flexible Work Policy	<p><b>Encourage leaders to market innovative Flexible Work options to potential employees.</b> In 2017, a PPCW task force conducted surveys on flex work utility. It recommended increased marketing of flexible work options in units across the campus. In 2019, USAC partnered with the PPCW to create a “Flex Work Toolkit,” to provide valuable resources that managers and employees across campus and the Medical Center can utilize when discussing flexible work arrangements.</p>	<p><b>2017-Ongoing</b></p>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b> Susan Basso, OHR Alison Mincey, OHR</p>
Parental Leave	<p><b>Expand parental leave to include post docs.</b> In 2015, the Faculty Resource Network began discussions on Parental Leave, Flexible Work Policy and other work-life intersections. In 2017, Provost McPheron joined the discussion on parental leave. In 2018, HR revised the University’s Paid Leave Programs policy to provide greater equity amongst Ohio State faculty and staff, including changes to parental leave eligibility and vacation accrual for post-doctoral researchers and associated faculty. The revised interim policy includes the following changes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•Eligible faculty and staff may receive parental leave immediately upon hire. The required one-year of employment service (and obtaining at least 1,560 hours of active pay status) to be eligible for parental leave</li> </ul>	<p><b>2015-2019</b></p>	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b> Susan Basso, OHR Bruce McPheron, OAA Kay Wolf, OAA</p>

	<p>has been eliminated.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•Term employees (including post-doctoral researchers) of at least 75 percent FTE are now eligible for parental leave.</li> <li>•Post-doctoral researchers will earn vacation leave in accordance with the accrual schedule.</li> <li>•Twelve-month associated faculty will earn vacation at the same accrual rate as 12-month regular faculty.</li> <li>•Term appointments that are eligible to accrue sick leave are now eligible for vacation donation.</li> </ul>		
Mentoring	<p><b>Consider a university wide faculty and staff mentoring program that is administered through the Office of Human Resources.</b> In 2017, a PPCW task force conducted surveys on mentoring and found that it was lacking in a coherent and institutionalized form in the University. Their recommendation was to formalize mentoring for faculty and staff at the university level with the recommendation that it incorporate components that are specific to women and ethnic/racial minorities. A draft policy was provided by the PPCW to the President and Provost in 2019.</p>	Unmet	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b>  Susan Basso, OHR  Bruce McPherson, OAA  Kay Wolf, OAA</p>
Childcare	<p><b>Provide additional childcare services to OSU faculty and staff.</b> PPCW met with the former and current senior HR partners along with the President and Provost about a new childcare facility and/or the possibility of contracting child care services with Bright Horizons.</p> <p>The OSUWMC is partnering with Juggle, Inc. beginning January 7, 2019 to provide backup/emergency childcare for OSUWMC faculty and staff. OSUWMC will pay for the first 1,000 booking fees for faculty and staff. The OSUWMC Legal team is working with Juggle to finalize an Agreement. <b>It is recommended that the University consider the feasibility of offering this benefit to all University faculty and staff. In 2019, progress has not yet been made in offering this benefit to all OSU faculty and staff.</b></p>	Unmet	<p><b><u>Senior Leader Partners</u></b>  Susan Basso, OHR  Joanne McGoldrick, OHR</p>

#### 4. Results/Findings

- See above.

#### 5. Next Steps

- Continue to monitor actions and activities related to recommendations.

#### 6. Recommendations

- Complete annual Closing the Loop reports.

# PPCW Pay Equity Task Force Final Report

---

## 1. Task Force Members

**Chairs:** Joyce Chen (Associate Professor, AEDE), Kristen Convery (Senior Director, University Marketing)

**Members:** Heather Brod (Executive Director of Center for Faculty Advancement Mentoring and Engagement, College of Medicine), Emily Caldwell (Media Relations Manager, Office of the President), Cynthia Callahan (Associate Professor, English), Molly Driscoll (Organizational Leadership Effectiveness Consultant, Office of Human Resources), Tiyi Morris (Associate Professor African American and African Studies), Azuka MuMin (Senior Fellow, DEAI, American Alliance of Museums and Consultant, Inclusive Cultural and Community Engagement)

2. **Charge:** Develop recommendations on improving pay equity and pay equity appeal process. Includes consultation with University Staff Advisory Committee (USAC), University Senate, and Office of Human Resources (OHR)

## 3. Process/Activities

- The task force has met six times during regular Council meetings. One meeting was held jointly with the University Staff Advisory Committee. Task force co-chairs also presented the mid-year report during the Council's mid-year meeting with the President and Provost.
- Individual task force members have sought opinions from researchers, faculty, staff and stakeholders including The Women's Place, OHR, Faculty Senate, USAC, and the community (through Big Table conversations).
- Co-chair Chen shared task force activities and findings with counterparts on the Syracuse University Committee on Faculty Gender Pay Equity.
- The university is poised to be a leader in our community and nationally on equity with commitments to the Columbus Commitment for Achieving Pay Equity, through the Columbus Women's Commission, President Drake's 2020 Vision (Diversity and Inclusion).

## 4. Results/Findings

- Reports from the Faculty Senate and academic research by task force members document a significant and persistent gender pay gap at Ohio State.
- Reviewed publication, Chen JJ, Crown D. The gender pay gap in academia: evidence from The Ohio State University. *Amer. J. Agr. Econ* 2019;101(5): 1337–1352; doi: 10.1093/ajae/aaz017 (Appendix A).
- A review of documents from leading organizations focused on gender equity indicate clearly that pay equity and equal pay must be treated as distinct concepts requiring different approaches. "Equal pay" refers to men and women receiving the same pay for the same job, while "pay equity" refers to receiving the same pay for work of equal value. Within the context of OSU, equal pay should be understood to refer to disparities for the same position within units, while pay equity refers to disparities for equivalent positions across units.
- A review of pay equity policies indicates that the burden of pursuing equitable pay falls on the individual faculty or staff member. Faculty must initiate a grievance process in order to receive a pay equity review, there isn't a formal process for staff pursuing equitable pay, and overall university policies provide little guidance on the topic, making collaborating to find solutions difficult.
- Moreover, unit leaders often lack the resources (funds, knowledge of institutional policy/process) to address pay equity issues and may be reluctant to acknowledge that inequities have arisen under their leadership, which may lead to and/or exacerbate conflict within units.
- Pay equity appeals have strong potential to create animosity with supervisors and colleagues due to the requirement that equity adjustments be provided through the usual Annual Merit Compensation Process.
- Implementation of Career Roadmap also has strong potential to create animosity with supervisors and colleagues, as individual concerns about position descriptions, titles, and salary bands can only be negotiated with the direct supervisor, and no clear guidelines have been given for how such concerns should be presented and addressed.

## 5. Next Steps

We believe the work ahead lies in three areas: creating a commonly held definition for pay equity, developing a toolkit/resource guide in collaboration with USAC, and applying a gender lens to ongoing HR changes.

- Defining Pay Equity/Total Rewards:** Additional collaboration is needed with other units (HR, USAC, University Senate) to answer the following questions: 1) What is included as pay (base salary, bonuses, paid time off, etc)? 2) Which populations are most in need of "equity"? (E.g. Which under-represented populations stand to benefit from work toward equity?), 3) To what extent will efforts to improve equal pay lead to progress on pay equity? PPCW anticipates that these questions will be partially addressed via the implementation of Career Roadmap and the external consultant's study

commissioned by the Provost.

- b. **Applying a Gender Lens to HR Changes:** PPCW members will maintain monthly check-ins with key constituents across the university regarding OHR plans with Career Roadmap and Workday to identify how these systems can support and promote pay equity, succession planning and progression for women and minoritized populations.

## 6. Recommendations

- a. **We recommend that the University provide and socialize clear definitions about pay equity, pay equality and the role of gender.** This clarity and alignment allows all faculty and staff to be deliberate in the choice of language with respect to gender pay gaps. “Equal” should be utilized to denote comparisons of individuals with the same job, while “equity” should be utilized to denote work of equal value to the University.
- b. **We recommend that the University undertake a thorough review of the pay equity appeal process** to identify how employee concerns about pay equity can be better supported by OHR and other units.
  - i. A pay equity “toolkit” should be developed to define the process for both faculty and staff members desiring to make a pay equity request or appeal (resources, information, and steps based on policy), and to identify common practices and the extent to which they align with existing university practices and policies.
  - ii. A similar toolkit should be developed to document best practices for managers/supervisors on how to process and make decisions regarding a pay equity request or appeal.
  - iii. The pay equity appeal process should be updated to minimize conflict between employees and supervisors and among colleagues within the same unit. For example, individuals could be permitted to submit pay equity appeals directly to HR, rather than supervisors, which would then trigger a unit-wide evaluation of pay equity to provide a degree of anonymity to the individual initiating the appeal.
- c. **We recommend that the charge for the pay equity task force be extended through the implementation of Career Roadmap and for a minimum of one year.** This additional time will give the task force an opportunity to participate in ongoing discussions with OHR; to gather more information about how Career Roadmap will affect staff; and to learn about how Ohio State can benefit from the city-wide learnings of the Columbus Women’s Commission.

## Barriers to Degree Completion Task Force Final Report

### • Task Force Members

Nita Williams (chair)	Director of Hematology Clinical Research	Comprehensive Cancer Center
Donna Bobbit-Zeher	Associate Professor Sociology	Marion Campus
Sheila Craft-Morgan	Senior Resource Planning Analyst	Institutional Research and Planning
Kim Doran	Director & Chief of Staff	Student Athlete Support Services Office
Elena Foulis	Senior Lecturer	Spanish & Portuguese
Shelly Martin	Assistant Director Patient Transport	OSU Wexner Medical Center
Jera Oliver	Director of Development	College of Food, Agricultural, and Environmental Sciences
Christine O'Malley	Senior Communications Consultant	Office of Human Resources

### • Charge

- To analyze barriers to degree completion for staff women who have started, not completed, and have not been enrolled for two or more years at any level (undergraduate, Masters, PhD, professional).

### • Process/Activities

- Institutional Research and Planning (IRP) queried records to identify all Ohio State staff who had started work toward, but not completed an undergraduate degree. That report was run against the National Student Clearinghouse to delete those who completed a degree elsewhere.
- Distributed a survey to 911 staff (men and women) via direct email seeking reasons for stopping progress toward an undergraduate degree and asked for additional demographics of respondents.
- IRP staff analyzed survey data.
- Met with Scott Klute, Office of Business and Finance, to find the impact on the university if these staff were to re-enroll.
- Collected information from Wexner Medical Center's Education, Development and Resources team within Human Resources about a program that provided tuition assistance to staff working toward degrees in nursing and select medical technology fields at Columbus State Community College in exchange for a two-year work commitment.

### • Results/Findings

Of the 911 staff who have taken courses but not earned an undergraduate degree, IRP identified 520 female staff (58%) in that category. These women work across the university in a diverse range of positions. The Office of Business and Finance reported that because the credit hours run through the budget model regardless of payer, the financial impact on the university would be minimal if all of these women were to complete their coursework.

Response rate for the survey was 11%. Work obligations were cited by two-thirds (67%) of respondents as a reason for stopping degree progress. A slight majority (54%) felt that non-traditional status was a barrier to completion.

The top suggestions for change by survey respondents were

1. Extension of tuition benefit to include community colleges;
2. More flexible work schedules; and
3. Increased scheduling of classes to online/weekends/evenings.

The tuition voucher program in the medical center has been discontinued. There is no centralized repository of information relating to this program and we were unable to collect concrete data relating to the number of staff participants, the length of the program, or the costs associated. In our communications with the Medical Center Human Resources team, however, it was represented as a failed program.



- **Next Steps**

- Share data with the University Staff Advisory Committee (USAC). USAC is also interested in this topic.
- Notify the Office of Distance Education and eLearning that there is a strong interest in more online coursework among our population. While our sample size was small, it has overwhelmingly indicated that this would be helpful.

- **Recommendations**

We recommend that senior leaders at dean/VP level and above reference in public forums the Flexible Work Toolkit that PPCW and USAC developed together: <https://usac.osu.edu/flexible-work-policy-resources/>

We emphasize to the president/provost and to senior leaders the final recommendations in our 2019 report:

For senior leaders at dean/VP level and above:

- Model flexible work arrangements in their offices.
- Talk about the Flexible Work Policy in public forums.
- Remove barriers to promoting it at the Wexner Medical Center.
- Remove barriers to promoting it across regional campuses and across departments/colleges on Columbus campus.

For president/provost:

- Assign an ad hoc team to review the policy and the Flexible Work Arrangement Proposal form and consider updating it to provide greater clarity to employees and managers considering Flexible Work Arrangements. This review team could include members of PPCW and USAC, senior HR professionals from campus (regional and main) and Medical Center, HR policy coordinator and HR associate vice president of talent, diversity and leadership.
- Assign a permanent team from the Office of Human Resources to track use of flexible work arrangements university-wide and share that data annually. The data reporting could be accomplished by requiring units to annually inform the policy owner of the following:
  - number of formal requests for flexible work arrangements received by unit in each calendar year
  - number approved
  - number denied and reason
  - number of ongoing flexible work arrangements
  - demographics of the employees seeking flexible work arrangements

The report should also include demographics of employees requesting flexible work arrangements. This information could be collected using employee ID numbers, but the current Flexible Work Arrangement Proposal forms do not collect employee ID numbers.

For the Office of Human Resources:

Include tuition coverage as a potentially funded activity to be reimbursed by the Staff Career Grant. This would include an update to language on the website as well as marketing information.

We opted to narrow the charge and did not continue with the assessment of the graduate and professional group after analyzing the data for the undergraduate group.